

FUR2601

(478736)

October/November 2013

FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

Duration

2 Hours

100 Marks

EXAMINERS ·

FIRST SECOND MR TW MASEKO MRS A SPIES

Closed book examination.

This examination question paper remains the property of the University of South Africa and may not be removed from the examination venue.

This paper consists of four (4) pages

PLEASE PAY CAREFUL ATTENTION TO THE FOLLOWING:

- 1. ANSWER ALL FOUR QUESTIONS. DO NOT SEPARATE SUBSECTIONS OF THE QUESTIONS.
- 2. QUESTION 1 SUBSECTION A MUST BE ANSWERED ON A SEPARATE MARK READING SHEET.
- 3. TAKE NOTE OF THE WAY IN WHICH THE MARKS ARE ALLOCATED AND ADAPT YOUR ANSWERS ACCORDINGLY.
- 4. REFER TO RELEVANT CASE LAW WHERE APPLICABLE.

QUESTION 1

SUBSECTION A: ANSWER ON MARK READING SHEET

Indicate whether the following statements are True or False by selecting the correct answer.

- A 1 Franco Seerdorf, a German soccer player, has a three-year contract to play for a South African soccer club Franco is therefore entitled to vote in the next general elections in South Africa.
 - 1) False, because foreign soccer players are not allowed vote
 - 2) True, because our Constitution is similar to the German Constitution
 - 3) True, because foreign nationals are entitled to all the rights in the Constitution
 - 4) False, because political rights are only granted to citizens of South Africa

(2)

- A 2 The Constitutional Court has exclusive jurisdiction to declare an Act of Parliament unconstitutional (2)
 - 1) True, because it is the highest court in South Africa
 - 2) False, because a High Court or the Supreme Court of Appeal may declare an Act of Parliament unconstitutional, but subject to confirmation by the Constitutional Court
 - 3) True, because the Constitutional Court consists of 11 judges
 - 4) False, because it shares a concurrent jurisdiction with the Equality Courts to declare an Act of Parliament unconstitutional
- A 3 A magistrates' court may declare a municipal by-law unconstitutional.
 - 1) True, because a magistrates' court is a creature of statute and, therefore, empowered to declare a municipal by-law unconstitutional
 - 2) False, because a municipal by-law is handled by the traditional courts
 - True, because a municipal by-law governs the area of the magistrates' court's
 jurisdiction
 - 4) False, because a magistrates' court as a creature of statute may not pronounce on the constitutionality of any law
- A 4 A magistrates' court may interpret legislation in accordance with the Bill of Rights (2)
 - 1) True, because this was confirmed by the Constitutional Court case of Masiya v The Director of Public Prosecution
 - 2) False, because a magistrates' court may not apply the Bill of Rights
 - 3) True, because a magistrates' court may apply the Bill of Rights indirectly in terms of section 39(2)
 - 4) False, because only the High Court and Supreme Court of Appeal may interpret legislation in accordance with the Bill of Rights
- A 5 The South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC) can invoke the right to freedom of expression (2)
 - 1) True, because all the rights in the Bill of Rights are for everyone, which includes both natural and juristic persons
 - 2) False, because the nature of the SABC is such that exercising this right is not part of its business
 - 3) False, because the nature of this right is such that it cannot be exercised or invoked by a juristic person.
 - 4) True, because there is nothing about the nature of this right that makes it impossible for juristic persons to invoke it.

SUBSECTION B

B 1	Does	the Bill of Rights apply to the following? Give reasons for your answers	
	11	A decision by Parliament to adopt a new Immigration Act.	(2)
	12	A decision by a private school to expel five learners.	(2)
	1 3.	An interim interdict issued by a magistrate's court	(2)
	14	The requirement that only people between the ages of 20 and 40 may apply membership of a gymnasium	for (2)
	15	A will in terms of which a female descendant is prevented from inheriting deceased estate	the (2)
B 2	Wha cıvıl	t is the basis for the distinction between socio-economic rights on the one hand a and political rights on the other?	and (3)
В3	Wha	t is the two-stage approach to the limitation of fundamental rights?	(2) [25]
QUE	STIC	N 2	
2 1	Disc	uss the difference between the direct and indirect application of the Bill of Rights ((10)
2 2	Wha	t is meant by standing (locus standi in iudicio), and why is it important?	(5)
2 3	attor wear	Jean, who has just completed his LLB degree, applies to Garlick & Ginger, a firm neys, for a position as an articled clerk. His application is turned down because is his hair in dreadlocks and, in his CV openly confesses to smoking dagga, which ck & Ginger's opinion, is not in keeping with the image of their firm. Advise Billy on wing matters	he ı. ın
	(I) (II) (III) (IV)	·	10) 25]

QUESTION 3

- 3 1 Does the text play any role in the interpretation of the Constituion or the Bill of Rights? Is textual (literal or grammatical) interpretation sufficient or conclusive? Answer this question with reference to relevant case law

 (10)
- 3 2 Is reading down a constituional remedy? How does it differ from severance and reading in? Refer to case law (10)
- 3 3 Can the general limitation clause in section 36 be applied to all rights in the Bill of Rights?(5)

QUESTION 4

- 4.1 Explain in your own words how the Constitutional Court approached the idea of unfair discrimination in *Harksen v Lane* (5)
- 4 2 Why is the equality clause such an important provision? (3)
- 4 3 You are a legal adviser to the Pretoria City Council The Council plans to evict a number of squatters from its land. The land has been earmarked for a housing project. Answer the following questions
 - a) May the council evict the squatters and demolish their dwellings? (2)
 - b) What procedure should be followed in order to do so? (5)
- 4.4 The Gauteng Department of Health decides to reduce the treatment given to Aids patients who have contracted tuberculosis. This is due to a shortage of funds and the Department's inability to meet the demands placed on it. However, painkillers and sedatives are still available is this decision constituional? Substantiate your answer with reference to case law.

TOTAL: {100}

[25]

© Unisa 2013

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA UNIVERSITEIT VAN SUID-AFRIKA **EXAMINATION MARK READING SHEET**

EKSAMEN-MERKLEESBLAD

STUDIE-EENHEID by PSY100-X	INTIALS AND SURRAME VODRILETTERS EN VAN	100 m
	DATE OF EXAMINATION	4
PAPER MUMBER VRAESTELNOMMER	EXAMINATION CENTRE (E.G. PRETT EKSAMENSENTRUM (BY PRETORI	
STUDENT NUMBER STUDENTENOMMER	-UNIEDE PAPER NO UMEKE VRAESTEL NR	1160
	118	
0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0 :0	(0) (0) (0) (0) (0) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1)	For use by examination invigilator
12 612 612 612 612 612 613 613		
	(2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)	1
25 r21 r25 r21 r21 r22 r21 r21 31 r31 r31 <u>r21 2</u> 1 r31 r31 r31	(2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (3) (3) (2 (4) (3) (3)	Vir gebruik deur eksamenopsiener
23 t21 t23 t21 t21 t21 t21 t21 33 t31 t31 t31 t31 t31 t31 t31 41 t41 t41	(2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (3) (3) (3) (3) (3) (4) (4) (4)	1
25 (21 (25 (21 (21 (21 (21 (21 (21 (21 (21 (21 (21	(2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (3) (3) (3) (3) (4) (4) (4) (4) (5) (5) (5) (5)	1
23	(2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (3) (3) (3) (4) (4) (4) (4) (6) (6) (6) (6) (6) (6) (6)	1
13 c13 c13 c13 c13 c13 c13 c13 c13 c13 c	(2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (3) (3) (3) (3) (4) (4) (4) (4) (5) (5) (5) (5)	1

- 1 USE ONLY AN HB PENCIL TO COMPLETE THIS SHEET
- 2. MARK LIKE THIS. 121
- 3. CHECK THAT YOUR INITIALS AND SURNAME HAS BEEN FILLED IN CORRECTLY
- 4. ENTER YOUR STUDENT NUMBER FROM LEFT TO RIGHT
- 5. CHECK THAT YOUR STUDENT NUMBER HAS BEEN FILLED IN CORRECTLY
- 6. CHECK THAT THE UNIQUE NUMBER HAS BEEN FILLED IN CORRECTLY
- 7 CHECK THAT ONLY ONE ANSWER PER QUESTION HAS BEEN MARKED
- 8. DO NOT FOLD

- 1 GEBRUIK SLEGS N HB-POTLOOD OM HIERDIE BLAD TE VOLTOOL
- 2. MERK AS VOLG. 12
- 3. KONTROLEER DAT U VOORLETTERS EN VAN REG INGEVUL IS
- 4 VUL U STUDENTENOMMER VAN LINKS NA REGS IN
- 5. KONTROLEER DAT U DIE KORREKTE STUDENTENOMMER VERSTREK HET
- 6. KONTROLEER DAT DIE UNIEKE NOMMER REG INGEVUL IS
- 7 MAAK SEKER DAT NET EEN ALTERNATIEF PER VRAAG GEMERK IS
- 8. MOENIE VOU NIE.

, PA	RT.	<u>}</u> -(,	ΑŃ	SI	NE	RS	ÿΑ	NT	wo	ORDE	;)- D	ÊE	L.	2	, <u>.</u> .	3	*, 4	ž *	1	Ť		^ 77	4 9	ž. j	, αντ. 1 → 1	., ş	3,7	4 '-		
·	1						3 15		10.3	36		_	•	_	ı c5:	F.,		71				:43 0		∯	108				(4) (
	2						1 (5		IA)	37					3 r6:		4	72						1 1 1 miles					143 E	
	3						1 C5		W	38 39) (5:) (5:		,_ 3	73 74				:41 0	5.	ka S	108				(4) (
· 🖒 - 🗓							5		Ŧ	40					, .p. , c5:		343	1 75				C43 C		* .	109 110				643 C	
		•			٠.,.			Ŀ	4. Jan.	~	- • •	• • •		-		* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	C-4-1	l "	•,,•		.3,		· N	الار ما د	1 '''	.,,				د ستر
	6	£1	3 6	23	c \$ 3	£42	1 (5	ır.	Ž.	41	c1 :	r2:	:3:	E4	1 (5:	ı Ç	· 1	76	rfa	c23	c33	(4) (52	200	111	r12	:23	133	c43 c	53
ست رشي	7						: c5		127	42						F.		77				c43 t		ريد کې	112	£13	£ 23	(32	t43 t	53 5 1,0
, 75 F	8						· c5		7.00	43	£12	£21	133	C4	1 (5:	12.3	4	78				C42 E		* *	113				143 E	
	9						· c5		e a	44	r\$ 1	(2)	£31	r4	o (5:	٠ پھر	-Q4-	79				C43 C		(p)	114				£40 £	
ه خيدا	19	¢ į	3 [23	(3)	T4:	C 5	"	- 34	45	r1 2	£ 23	£32	24	1 (5:	~	~.	80	(1)	£53	£33	C42 C	51 4		115	r13	r 2 3	c33	C40 C	53
15. E.	11		. , .	١.		-41	1 (5	1	12.3.4	46	-4.		- 2 -	- 4	2 c5:	, H	7-44	81	-4-	-4-	-3-	(4) (<u>.</u> .['	***	44.0		- 4-	-9-	-41	
	12						5		- -\$	1 27					· (5:		•	82				C43 E		5					(4) (5	
'~e	13						15		. 3 35 m.	48					151		~	83				£43 £							143 C	
٠ ٪،	14	€1	3 6	2)	:3°	r4 2	c5	ď	Ť	49					: 5:		• *]	84				الزاح		1.1	7				£43 £	
-	15	٤1	3 (3	:3 2	r43	15	1	300	50	c [3	£23	£31	r4:	r51		, E	65	113	£22/	33		ÞΝ	\ U	13				€43 €	
~~~ ·								1	£	j .						-	, 15	4		1		<b>.</b>								
1 St. 1	15						15		, Ĝ.,	51	_	-	-		r 53	1.		15				<b>1</b> (		ž. 14	121				E43 E	
F . F . PA	17						c5:		e 4.1	52			):33					. 8				C42 C		باريخ. چينان ۾	122				c40 c5	
3	18 19						c5:		ارية	33			3.		ď.	M.	u	<b>●85</b> 89				643 C		, P.	123 124		_	-	c40 c5	
3	20				-	-	¢5:		4 6 💎				V.			-	٠. ا	80				(4) r		ź i	125				£43 £5	
10 or	_	.,				Ä					I.	_				] ≽ੂ	- ]				- 40	-	٠,	, *** d	سد.	-,-	-2-	-0-	-40	1
<u> </u>	21	r1	3 t2	3 (	32	Ŀ	٤5.	T	-1	56.	, it	17,	£ 33	C4:	c53	.==	,-	91	£13	c23	c33	C43 C	50 r 1	होता है	126	c <b>1</b> 3	c 2 3	c31	t43 t5	ر <u>آ</u> ساور
-	22						•	A		37					c53		'	\$2				C43 E		_144	127				C43 C5	
: ?^1	23					:42		1	127	58					(5)		,	93				c43 C	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	ر آھي	128				c43 c5	
	24						c5:		χ.	59					151		· - ,	94				642 E			129				c43 c5	
* * * *	25	ÇΊ	3 62	9 (	33	(4)	15.	<b>'</b>	, °	60	113	123	£33	E 4.3	(5)	7	-1	95	c [ 3	£Z3	C31	C43 E	53		130	נןז	cZ3	£33	t43 t5	J
يم 🗈	26	<b>E</b> 1	1 (2	· ) (	33	( <b>4</b> )	t5:	<b>.</b>		61	£13	£23	(3)	E # 3	r53	na ta	*	96	(1)	£23	£33	:43 C	51 5	**************************************	131	(1)	r 2 1	.21	£43 £5	, i.,
*****	77	(1	, rž	3 1	3)	c43	c5:	L.	a . 5 %						c53		.~4	97					53		132				:43 £5	
7	28	EŤ	y c 2		3>	c43	c51	١.	-£	63	113	£23	133	642	c52	Ł.,		98				:43 t		<u>,                                    </u>	133				c43 c5	
2.0	29		_		_	-	r51	1 5	<b>4</b>	64						7	- 1	99 .					53 E.	CONTRACT OF THE PARTY.	134	cta	(2)	<b>13</b> 3	c42 c5	<b>3</b> [
- 7	30	۲1	ı (2	3 (	31	c <b>4</b> 3	151	ŧ.	4 29	65	(1)	£23	c33	c43	(5)	j-	~	100	£\$3	c23 .	<b>(3</b> )	c43 c	52 L	9	135	r†3	c <b>2</b> 2	c33	c43 c5	al [*] ^ '°'.
S -1							- <b>-</b> -		[ \ \frac{1}{2}								o* -		- 4 -				t, 1	42 1 44				_		ş
F-12.	31 32	17	, ,	, ,	33	643 647	(5)	100	が (重)	66 67								101 102					53 63		136	-	_	_	t4> t5:	
. ~-3	33						(5)		- <u>S</u>	68	(†)	-21 C)2	.32	641	(6)	`` <u>**</u> *	~	103					53		137 138		_	_	c42 c5: c42 c5:	- F
1	34						:53		, v	69						ر ہے		104					3 - [5] 3 - [5],		139				. 43 c5:	
ود سد ٢	35						(5)		F. 3	70	(1)						- [	105					53 C. Te		140				C42 C5:	
جار ₍₁ . ک	and the same	7. O.	572	ر دوسا	₹,	r t ng	oso	ŭ,	1 4 E	خت ک			ο.			٠٠.	. 1			-			,'#ł	.uŝ ^#]	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	-70	<del>-</del>	<del>-</del>		T